

CHAPTER 15

CHORISTERS' PERCEPTION, PRACTICES, AND STYLES ADOPTED IN MUSICAL KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER AMONG MAINLINE AND PENTECOSTAL CHURCHES IN ABEOKUTA, OGUN STATE, NIGERIA

Soretire 1 *, Eyitayo A., Okedairo, Olufemi O., Lawal, Deborah T. and Onyeke, Blessing U.

Abstract

This study investigated the disparity in styles, practices, and choristers' perception of musical knowledge transfer among mainline and Pentecostal churches in Abeokuta, Ogun State, Nigeria. Specifically, the work seeks to ascertain choristers' perceptions of musical knowledge transfer and examine the disparities in practices and styles involved in the transfer of musical knowledge among Mainline and Pentecostal churches. Multi-stage sampling procedure was used to select a total of 367 choristers across Mainline and Pentecostal churches. A structured questionnaire was used to collect the relevant data. This was further subjected to face validity and reliability tests using the split-half method. A Cronbach Alpha value of $0.8 > \alpha \leq 0.7$ attested to the instrument's reliability. Frequency distribution, mean, and analysis of variance, were the inferential analytical tools used for the study. Results indicate that choristers perceived the transfer of musical knowledge as possible, provided directors are musically certified ($x=4.43$). Mainline 202 Choristers' Perception, Practices, and Styles Adopted in Musical Knowledge churches had learned of hymns ($x=2.89$) as the most practiced area of musical learning while Pentecostals dwelt more on contemporary music learning ($x=2.82$). Significant differences existed in the mean ratings of the perception of choristers on music education across churches ($F=7.009$). Conclusively, there is a need for the development of music styles and practices suitable for effective teaching and learning of church music. It is strongly recommended that instructors, directors, and choristers be musically trained, knowledgeable, and skillful for the overall success of the transfer of musical knowledge.

Keywords: knowledge transfer, mainline, Pentecostal churches.

Introduction

In the greater exchange of musical knowledge among Nigerian churches, certain churches' musical performances can still be considered subpar. The achievement of the church's evangelical aims through music and the performance of choristers still lag (Weston, 2020). For church choirs to achieve the necessary success in producing greater musical outputs with little to no aid, they nevertheless need to be placed on sound and healthy pedestals. Choristers are not able to interpret music due to a deficiency in the transfer of musical knowledge. However, when music is performed seriously and lifelessly, it misinterprets what is intended to be a joyful performance. The choristers' inability to express themselves through their singing (Dingle, 2019) prevents the music's message from being understood by the listener. Many choir members who have been there for more than 20 years are found to be unable to sing simple melodies well, and many develop musical tone blindness as a result of

inadequate aural training. To name a few, there are also shortcomings in the areas of voice instruction, performance ethics, stage management, microphone management, and mastering different musical instruments.

Research on the music industry in Nigeria reveals that choristers in Pentecostal and Mainline churches, particularly in Abeokuta, Ogun state, are still far from becoming proficient. In actuality, some earlier researchers, such as Vidal (2012) and others, merely assert that the musical endeavors of certain church choir members nowadays represent the lowest point of biblical principles and music aesthetics and that the norm for Christian music is subpar and shallow theologically and musically. Furthermore, many of the church musicians are poor in theological underpinnings, music appreciation Musicology, the Arts and the New Normal 203 skills, hymn singing techniques, directing, and choir administration- all of which boil down to a lack of quality transmission of musical knowledge.

- i. What are the choristers' perceptions of the need for the transfer of musical knowledge?
- ii. What are the disparities in practices and styles involved in the transfer of musical knowledge between Mainline and Pentecostal Churches?

Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses were tested at $P > 0.05$ level of significance H_0 : There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of the perception of musical knowledge transfer across churches (Analysis of Variance).

Research Methodology

Population of the Study

A population is a set of similar items or events which is of interest to a study. The population of this study comprised all choristers in all Mainline and Pentecostal churches in Abeokuta North, Abeokuta South, and Odeda local government areas, Ogun State, Nigeria. The sampling procedure/steps highlighted below are as follows:

Step I: First, out of the four (4) Local Government Areas (LGAs) that constitute the Abeokuta metropolis of Ogun State (that is Abeokuta North LGA, Abeokuta South LGA, Odeda LGA, and Obafemi Owode LGA), 50 percent (two) of them namely: Abeokuta South and Odeda LGAs were purposively selected for this study due to concentration of mega-churches in the LGAs.

Step II: Secondly, from the two (2) selected LGAs, 40 percent of the 26 mega churches in the sampled LGAs were randomly selected. This produced 10 churches across the LGAs. The churches were stratified into two (2) namely: Orthodox and Pentecostal churches while in each LGA both Orthodox and Pentecostal churches were selected from Abeokuta South and Odeda Local Government Areas.

Step III: From the ten (10) sampled churches, 13 percent of the two thousand eight hundred and twenty-one (2,821) choristers were selected through a simple random sampling technique. Across churches, 13 percent of the sampled respondents produced 16 choristers from Living Faith Church

(Winners Chapel), 52 choristers from Catholic Church Osiele, 13 choristers 204 Choristers' Perception, Practices, and Styles Adopted in Musical Knowledge from Mountain of Fire & Miracle Ministries, 26 choristers from Deeper Life Bible Church, 78 choristers from Redeemed Christian Church of God, 20 choristers from Apostolic Church, 46 choristers from Anglican Church, 52 choristers from Baptist Church Ibara, 45 choristers from Methodist Church while 19 choristers were sampled from African Church. This produced 367 choristers across churches which constitute the sample size for the study.

Results and Discussion

Perception Level of Transfer of Musical Knowledge

Respondents' perception of musical knowledge transfer across the church groups is revealed in **Table 1**. The table shows that the perception of musical knowledge transfer was favorable across churches (53.1%). It follows that the perception of church musical knowledge transfer was more favorable among mainline (62.3%) than Pentecostal churches (43.2%). This implies that generally there is a positive perception of musical knowledge transfer across churches. Teaching-learning of church music was more favorably perceived among mainline churches than Pentecostal churches.

Table 1: Perception level of church musical knowledge transfer

	Classification of the church you belong									
	Mainline		Pentecostal		Total					
	f	F	F	F	Mean	Maxi- mum	Mini- mum	Standard Deviation		
Perception Unfavorable perception	72	37.7	100	56.8	172	46.9				
Favorable perception	119	62.3	76	43.2	195	53.1	110.66	162.00	77.00	10.09

Choristers' Perception of Transfer of Musical Knowledge

Mainline Churches: In Mainline churches, good ethics, discipline, and time management being part of church music education ($x=4.60$) ranked first among choristers (Table 2). Also, choristers have favorable perception towards the necessity for church music directors to be musically certified to enhance effective church music education ($x=4.57$), development of self-confidence for effective musical performance without any stage fright ($x=4.56$), the use of tonic-solfa/staff notation/ sight reading and

singing Musicology, the Arts and the New Normal 205 (x=4.49), conducting, composition, choir management/stage management, microphone management and costume management (x=4.46), church music education can improve competency in vocal and instrumental performances (x=4.46), choristers education on singing with the language well understood by the audience (x=4.45). Church music education is necessary for the effective propagation of the gospel message (x=4.42), and church music education enhances church growth and development (x=4.39). Church music education can improve competency in the playing of different kinds of musical instruments (x=4.38), and appropriateness to teach and learn the playing of various musical instruments by staff notation/sight playing method (x=4.35). The vocal capacity and production of each chorister should be taught in church music education (x=4.33). Church music education is time demanding and requires absolute discipline (x=4.31). Listening/ear training methods should be encouraged for playing musical instruments in church music education (x=4.31), a unified teaching and learning curriculum for church music education since there is a common goal of music in the church (x=4.25). Church music education should be perpetuated through music classes in the church (x=4.19). Breaking into different voice parts during rehearsals is the most appropriate method of teaching and learning parts songs effectively (x=4.18) in that order.

Also, the perception of choristers is unfavorable as regards imitation/ observation method of teaching (x=4.08), with psalms and hymns being major aspects of mainline churches' music education (x=4.06). Church music education is mainly relevant for choral performances (x=3.93). Pentecostal and Mainline churches have their music education/rehearsals on Saturdays and Wednesday evenings (x=3.82). Choir members should be trained outside the church(x=3.77). Church music education should be available to church members alone(x=3.68), psalms and hymns are major aspects of Pentecostal churches' music education(x=3.54), and contemporary musical styles like pop, raps, jazz, blues, and rock should be included in church music education(x=3.47). Church music education should be for commercial purposes, showmanship, and career development (x=3.26) and church music education is too rigorous to be accomplished and may not be necessary(x=3.20).

Pentecostal churches: Table 2 shows descriptive statistics of choristers' perception of music education in Pentecostal churches. Results indicate that the development of self-confidence for effective musical performance without any stage fright (x=4.65) is rated first among Pentecostal choristers. This is 206 Choristers' Perception, Practices, and Styles Adopted in Musical Knowledge followed by the use of tonic-solfa/staff notation/sight reading and singing (x=4.62), good ethics, discipline, and time management should be part of church music education (x=4.53). Church music education can improve competency in vocal and instrumental performances (x=4.53) among others.

Mainline and Pentecostal churches: As shown in Table 2, the development of self-confidence for effective musical performance without any stage fright (x=4.60) was ranked first with more within Pentecostal (x= 4.65) than mainline churches (x=4.56). Self-confidence can translate to positive human relations, more comfortable communication, and teamwork. The finding corroborates Vannatta-Hall (2010) which stresses the need for confidence and competence in church music education. Specific methods of teaching and learning, such as staff and solfa notations are most often found to be followed by church music handlers to ensure better musical performance. Also, music education must see that

crucial rhythmic skills, staff notation/ sight reading and singing are developed through the use of proper musical experiences (Reifinger, 2006; Weston, 2020 Camlin et. al, 2020).

Table 2: Disparities of Perception in Transfer of Musical Knowledge

Perception items	Classification of the church you belong		
	Mainline	Pentecostal	Total
Church music education should be available to church members alone	3.68	3.30	3.50
Church music education should be perpetuated through music classes in the church	4.19	4.23	4.21
Choir members should be trained outside the church	3.77	3.36	3.57
Church music directors must be musically certified to enhance effective church music education	4.57	4.28	4.43
Church music education is necessary for effective propagation of the gospel message through music by the choristers	4.42	4.37	4.40
Church music education is mainly relevant to choral performances	3.93	3.60	3.77
Church music education is time-demanding and requires absolute discipline	4.31	4.50	4.40
Church music education should be for commercial purposes, showmanship, and career development	3.26	2.84	3.06
Contemporary musical styles like pop, rap, jazz, blues, and rock should be included in church music education	3.47	3.01	3.25
Conducting, composition, choir management/stage management, microphone management, and costume management, should be included in church music	4.46	4.34	4.40

education

Psalms and hymns are major aspects of Pentecostal churches' music education	3.54	3.91	3.72
Psalms and hymns are major aspects of mainline churches' music education	4.06	4.14	4.10
Choristers should be educated on singing in a language well understood by the audience	4.45	4.49	4.47
Church music education is too rigorous to be accomplished and may not be necessary	3.20	2.96	3.08
Good ethics, discipline, and time management should be part of church music education	4.60	4.53	4.56
There should be a unified teaching and learning curriculum for church music education since there is a common goal of music in the church	4.25	4.10	4.17
Church music education enhances church growth and development	4.39	4.44	4.42
Pentecostal and Mainline churches have their music education/rehearsals on Saturdays and Wednesday evenings.	3.82	3.41	3.62
Church music education can improve competency in the playing of different kinds of musical instruments	4.38	4.49	4.43
Church music education can improve competency in vocal and instrumental performances	4.46	4.53	4.49
The use of tonic-solfa/ staff notation/ sight reading and singing has yielded positive results and should be highly encouraged in the teaching and learning of songs among church choristers.	4.49	4.62	4.55
Imitation/observation method of teaching and learning of songs is easy and most appropriate to be	4.08	3.91	4.00

used among church choristers.

Breaking into different voice parts during rehearsals	4.18	4.40	4.22
is the most appropriate method of teaching and learning parts songs effectively			
Listening/ ear training (sing, I hear, and play)	4.31	4.13	4.22
method should be encouraged for playing musical instruments in church music education			
It is appropriate to teach and learn the playing of various musical instruments by staff notation/ sight playing method for self-reliance and competency.	4.35	4.20	4.28
The vocal capacity and production of each chorister should be taught in church music education to achieve remarkable performance/ministration.	4.33	4.49	4.41
Development of self-confidence for effective musical performance without any stage fright is needed in church music education.	4.56	4.65	4.60

x4.089---favorable perception; ; x<4.089....Unfavorable perception

Disparities in mean ratings of practices involved the transfer of musical knowledge practices among Mainline and Pentecostal Christian churches:

Table 3 reveals that there is more singing in parts among mainline choristers ($\bar{x}=2.88$) than among Pentecostals ($\bar{x}=2.80$). Results indicate that the level of practice of solo/melody singing is alike among mainline ($\bar{x}=2.73$), and Pentecostal ($\bar{x}=2.73$) with choruses, praise, and worship ranked third among the two churches. However, there are more choruses, praise, and worship in Pentecostal ($\bar{x}=2.82$) than mainline ($\bar{x}=2.65$). Singing “in parts” implies each voice (such as soprano, tenor, alto, and bass) has its independent line to follow. The contents of that line will be written out and will depend on the composer or arranger and the harmonic structure of the piece (Dingle et. al, 2019; Camlin et. al 2020).

Table 3: Comparison of mean ratings of practices involved Transfer of Musical Knowledge practices across churches

Classification of the church you belong

	Mainline Mean	Pentecostal Mean	Total Mean
Solo/melody singing	2.73	2.73	2.73
Singing in parts	2.88	2.80	2.84
Choral performance	2.43	2.34	2.39
A cappella performance	2.22	1.86	2.05
Hymn/ congregational singing	2.89	2.52	2.71
Voice training	2.36	2.52	2.44
Instrumental training	2.09	2.31	2.20
Band performance	2.26	1.61	1.95
1 Choruses	2.65	2.82	2.73
2 Praise and worship	2.65	2.82	2.73
Orchestra performance	1.83	1.89	1.86
Rhythms/dance movement	1.96	1.65	1.81
Conducting	2.07	2.19	2.13
Musical notation	2.26	2.07	2.17
Sight reading/playing	2.01	1.85	1.93
Composition and musical arrangement	2.25	2.18	2.22
Aural/ ear training	1.81	1.91	1.86
Analyzing and evaluating music performances	2.05	2.36	2.20
Stage/ microphone management	2.04	2.51	2.26
Choir ethics	2.30	2.56	2.43
Time management	2.24	2.64	2.43
Costume Management	1.98	2.18	2.08
Diction (how wordings of songs should be pronounced)	2.34	2.45	2.39

Disparities in mean rating of styles involved in the transfer of musical knowledge

Mainline Church: Fig. 7 shows that singing in unison ($x=2.61$) is the most utilized among the music styles in mainline churches. It is evident from the study that the parts rehearsal method ($x=2.58$), organizing/attendance of carols methods ($x=2.51$), organizing/attendance of concert method ($x=2.47$), solfa/lyrics dictation method ($x=2.46$), demonstration method ($x=2.45$), personal development method ($x=2.43$), memorization method ($x=2.39$), observation method ($x=2.36$), staff notation ($x=2.12$), learning by imitation (rote method) ($x=2.07$), sight reading/playing ($x=2.02$), use of shapes notes ($x=2.02$), playing by ear method ($x=1.86$) are also used in that order (Table 4).

Pentecostal churches: Results reveal that the parts rehearsal method ($x=2.62$) ranks first among music styles adopted in Pentecostal churches. It is also shown from the results that singing in unison ($x=2.61$), personal development method ($x=2.53$), memorization method ($x=2.32$), observation method ($x=2.25$), organizing/attendance of concert method ($x=2.23$), solfa/lyrics dictation method ($x=2.22$), playing by ear method ($x=2.14$), 210 Choristers' Perception, Practices, and Styles Adopted in Musical Knowledge demonstration method ($x=2.06$), organizing/attendance of carols methods ($x=1.99$), learning by imitation ($x=1.92$), staff notation ($x=1.84$), sight reading/ playing ($x=1.83$) and use of shapes notes ($x=1.60$).

Styles involved in the transfer of musical knowledge among Mainline and Pentecostal Christian churches:

Fig. 7 shows that singing in unison is the most utilized ($x=2.61$) among mainline ($x=2.61$) and Pentecostal churches ($x=2.61$). It follows from the study that there is a preference for the parts rehearsal method among Pentecostal choristers ($x=2.58$) compared to mainline ($x=2.62$). Also, there is more of a personal development style among Pentecostals ($x=2.53$) than mainline ($x=2.43$). The figure also indicates that memorization method ($x=2.36$), organizing/attendance of concert method($x=2.35$), solfa/lyrics dictation method ($x=2.34$), observation method ($x=2.31$), organizing/attendance of carols methods($x=2.26$), demonstration method ($x=2.26$), learning by imitation ($x=2.00$), playing by ear method ($x=1.99$), staff notation ($x=1.99$), sight reading/playing ($x=1.93$) and use of shapes notes ($x=1.82$) across sampled churches (Table 4).

Table 4: Styles involved in the transfer of musical knowledge among Mainline and Pentecostal Christian churches

	Classification of the church you belong		
	Mainline Mean	Pentecostal Mean	Total Mean
Sight reading/playing	2.02	1.83	1.93

Playing by ear method	1.86	2.14	1.99
Staff notation	2.12	1.83	1.99
Solfa/ lyrics dictation method	2.46	2.22	2.34
Use of shapes notes	2.02	1.60	1.82
Learning by imitation (Rote method)	2.07	1.92	2.00
Observation method	2.36	2.25	2.31
Memorization method	2.39	2.32	2.36
Parts rehearsal method	2.58	2.62	2.60
Singing in unison	2.61	2.61	2.61
Organizing/attendance of concert method	2.47	2.23	2.35
Organizing/ attendance of carols methods	2.51	1.99	2.26
Demonstration method	2.45	2.06	2.26
Personal development method	2.43	2.53	2.48

Fig. 7: Church music styles Hypotheses testing

HO₂: There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of the perception of choristers on music education across churches.

The one-way ANOVA procedure produces a one-way analysis of variance for a quantitative dependent variable (perception of church transfer of musical knowledge) by a single factor variable (church classification). The difference in the mean ratings of choristers' perception of the transfer of musical knowledge across churches is shown in Table 5. Results reveal that there is a significant difference in the mean ratings of the perception of choristers on the transfer of musical knowledge across churches ($F=7.009$; $p \leq 0.05$). However, mainline choristers' perception of church transfer of musical knowledge was more favorable (111.9895) compared with choristers from Pentecostal churches (109.2216).

Table 5: Analysis of variance in the mean ratings of the perception of choristers' Transfer of Musical Knowledge across churches

Mean	Std. Devi- ation	Std. Error	95% Confidence Interval for Mean	Mini- mum	Maxi- mum
------	---------------------	------------	-------------------------------------	--------------	--------------

				Lower Bound	Upper Bound		
Mainline	111.9895	10.42618	.75441	110.5014	113.4776	77.00	162.00
Pentecostal	109.2216	9.52901	.71828	107.8040	110.6392	81.00	133.00
Total	110.6621	10.08788	.52658	109.6266	111.6976	77.00	162.00

ANOVA

	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Between Groups	701.767	1	701.767	7.009	.008
Within Groups	36544.337	365	100.121		
Total	37246.104	366			

Conclusion

Perception of church transfer of musical knowledge becomes favorable as churches improve in the training of instructors, improving knowledge and skilfulness, simplicity of teaching and learning methods, interchange of methods, commitment, and dedication, passion for the calling/ministry, more accustomed to various seasons in church calendar and due diligence on the part of choir directors.

Recommendations

In light of the study's conclusions, the researcher determines that the following recommendations are essential:

- i. Churches must ensure that choristers receive proper musical training and retraining to handle the various musical styles and practices found in mainline and Pentecostal churches.
- ii. The growth and development of choristers who used rudiments and theory of music, voice training, performance ethics, microphone management, stage management, learning various musical instruments, and aural training as their primary areas of musical study were found to be highly effective. Therefore, it is advised that churches of all stripes make music education a priority.
- iii. Church leaders and other important stakeholders in church music education should foster a sense of commitment, dedication, and passion for the calling and ministry among choristers in both Pentecostal and mainline churches. As the survey found, choristers' opinions on church music education have a big impact on how they respond to musical styles and practices.

References

Camlin, D.A., Daffern, H. & Peterson, K. (2020) Group singing as a resource for the development of a healthy public: a study of adult group singing. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 7(1):1-60. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-020-00549-0>. *Musicology, the Arts and the New Normal* 213

Dingle, G.A., Dingle, S.C., Saoirse F. (2019) An agenda for best practice research on group singing, health, and well-being. *Music Sci* 2:1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2059204319861719>.

Reifinger, J.L.(2006). Skill development in rhythm perception & performance: A review of literature. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*. 25(1):15-27. doi:10.1177/87551233060250010103.

Vannatta-Hall, J. E. (2010). Music education in early childhood teacher education: The impact of a music method course on pre-service teachers' perceived confidence & competence to teach music. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Illinois.

Vidal, A.O. (2008). Music Education in Nigeria: Entering the 21st Century with Pragmatic Philosophy. *Journal of the Association of Nigerian Musicologists*. (special edition) (p.1).

Weston, D. (2020). An ecology of musical livelihoods. *Music Education Research*, 22, 5, 491-494. DOI: 10.1080/14613808.2020.1842304